

TARTU SEMIOTICS LIBRARY 17

Series editors:

Kalevi Kull

Silvi Salupere

Peeter Torop

Advisory board:

Tatiana Chernigovskaya (St.Petersburg State University, Russia)

Robert E. Innis (University of Massachusetts Lowell, USA)

Frederik Stjernfelt (Aarhus University, Denmark)

Jaan Valsiner (Aalborg University, Denmark)

Ekaterina Velmezova (Lausanne University, Switzerland)

Vilmos Voigt (Eötvös Loránd University, Hungary)

Tartu Semiootika Raamatukogu 17

Тартуская библиотека семиотики 17

Peirce semiotõlkes

Пирс в семиоперевосде

SEMIOTRANSLATING PEIRCE

Douglas Robinson



UNIVERSITY OF TARTU
press

Book series Tartu Semiotics Library editors: Kalevi Kull, Silvi Salupere,
Peeter Torop

Editor of the current volume: Elin Sütiste, with the assistance of Mark Mets

Address of the editorial office:
Department of Semiotics, University of Tartu,
Jakobi St. 2, Tartu 51014, Estonia

<http://www.flfi.ut.ee/en/departement-semiotics/tartu-semiotics-library>

Copyright: University of Tartu, 2016

ISSN 1406-4278

ISBN 978-9949-77-247-6 (print)

ISBN 978-9949-77-306-0 (pdf)

University of Tartu Press
www.tyk.ee

Contents

List of abbreviations	7
0. Preface	11
0.1. Peircean approaches to the study of translation	11
0.2. The structure of the book	16
0.3. Acknowledgments	19
1. Defining semiotranslation	21
1.1. <i>Semiotics and the Problem of Translation</i>	22
1.2. <i>On Translating Signs</i>	26
1.3. <i>Wittgenstein in Translation</i>	30
2. Test case 1: Semiotranslating Peirce into Finnish	35
2.1. <i>Johdatus tieteen logiikkaan</i>	35
2.1.1. Activist translation	35
2.1.2. The authority to translate this way or that	39
2.1.3. Domestication vs. foreignization	43
2.2. “Mikä merkki on?”	47
2.3. Semiotranslation tested	53
2.4. Icosis	56
2.5. Conclusion	60
3. Test case 2: Semiotranslating “Prufrock” into Finnish	61
3.1. Serial semiotranslation of “Prufrock”	61
3.1.1. Eliot’s original	61
3.1.2. Leo Tiainen’s translation	63
3.1.3. Ville Repo’s translation	65
3.2. Poetic content	70
3.2.1. Plot summary	70
3.2.2. Allegory of translation	72
3.2.3. “Prufrock” allegorized and semiotranslated	74
3.2.4. The other ideal	79
3.3. Conclusion	83
4. Exploring semiotranslation	85
4.1. <i>Semiotics and the Problem of Translation</i>	87
4.2. <i>On Translating Signs</i>	90
4.2.1. Abducing semiotranslation	90
4.2.2. Deducing semiotranslation	94
4.3. <i>Wittgenstein in Translation</i>	99
4.3.1. Wittgenstein and Peirce.....	99
4.3.2. Obstacles to understanding	101

4.3.3. Semiotranslation revisited.....	104
4.4. Conclusion	113
5. Test case 3: Semiotranslating Wittgenstein into English	115
5.1. Goriée on Peter Winch's English translations of the <i>Vermischte Bemerkungen</i> as <i>Culture as Value</i>	115
5.1.1. Punctuation ("word symbols" or " <i>bricolages</i> ")	118
5.1.2. Single words ("names" or " <i>bricolages</i> ")	119
5.1.3. Whole sentences ("propositions")	122
5.2. The take-away	125
5.2.1. Equivalence: conservation or transformation?	126
5.2.2. Equivalence: Wittgenstein's "real meaning" as immediate object	129
5.2.3. Equivalence: testing for conservation-as-transformation	132
5.2.4. Building blocks	137
5.2.5. A Peircean rethinking of Goriée's analytical model	139
5.2.6. Fragments as <i>bricolages</i>	147
5.2.7. Semiotranslation as therapy	150
5.3. Conclusion	152
6. Test case 4: Semiotranslating Wittgenstein into Finnish	155
6.1. Nyman's Finnish translation of the <i>Vermischte Bemerkungen</i> as <i>Yleisiä huomautuksia</i>	157
6.2. Nyman's Finnish translation of the <i>Bemerkungen über die Philosophie der Psychologie</i> , Band 2, as <i>Huomautuksia psykologian filosofiasta 2</i>	164
6.2.1. Translation problems	165
6.2.2. Tragedy and sympathy, feeling and use	167
6.2.3. Semiotranslating Wittgenstein	173
6.3. Uschanov's Finnish translation of the <i>Denkbewegungen</i> as <i>Ajatusliikkeitä</i>	174
6.4. Conclusion	179
7. Icoses of semiotranslation	180
7.1. Equivalence and authorial intention	180
7.2. Culture	184
7.2.1. Peirce on science as collective action	184
7.2.2. Implications of collectivism for semiotic communication	189
7.2.3. Empathy and the somatic exchange	191
7.2.4. Icosis as the cultural semiosis of truth	195
7.2.5. Evolutionary love as icosis	197
7.2.6. Semiotranslation as icosis	200
7.2.7. Semiotranslation as sociotherapy	205
7.3. Conclusion	218
References	223
Notes	236
Index	271